Analysis of cultural content in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners

Siti Arusah Rusydah dan Lulu Laela Amalia[*]

English Language Education Study Program, Faculty of Language and Literature Education,
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Jl. Dr. Setiabudhi No. 229 Bandung 40154, West Java, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

This study investigates the cultural content in online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. The data of this study were collected by selecting the reading materials available in English materials for the tenth-grade senior high school students published in an online learning platform. The materials consist of four units, each composed of various texts such as narrative, descriptive, recount, and announcement. This study was conducted qualitatively by using a content analysis method. To reveal which cultures are represented in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners, the cultural contents are categorized into the source, target, or international cultures (Cortazzi & Jin, 1999). In addition, culture in this research is perceived in terms of products, persons, practices, and perspectives, as proposed by Yuen (2011); the frequency of each culture category was then converted to percentages for comparison purposes. These percentages were then analyzed to determine which culture is represented in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners and which category occurs the most frequently. The study finds that the source culture is predominant in online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. Most of the cultural content found is represented by the element of persons and products. The investigation found that 51.28% of cultural content refers to the source culture, 12.82% refers to the target culture, and 35.90% refers to the international culture. Based on the findings, it is recommended that more target cultures and international cultures be included in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners.

INTRODUCTION

The term culture has been widely defined from a variety of different perspectives. According to Hermawan and Noerkhasanah (2012), culture has been described by many linguists, starting from the general perspective to the most specific one. In this case, Rogers and Steinfatt (1999) emphasize that, in general, culture can refer to people's total way of life composed of their learned and shared behavior patterns, values, norms, and material objects. In addition, Jiang and Zaid (as

---

[*] Corresponding email: luluamalia75@gmail.com

cited in Damar, 2013) more specifically emphasize that culture can be described as anything people share and learn in a particular society. This can include everything that is involved in human life. People in a certain group know and share different types of language, religion, cuisine, social habits, values, music, and arts from the other groups of people, depending on where they live. Therefore, by summing up both views, it can be concluded that the way a particular group of people lives, thinks, behaves, and speaks is highly influenced by the culture itself. Thus, the complex nature of culture has turned it to cover many areas of human life, including language. In relation to language, culture, and language are closely interwoven (Kramsch, 1998; Brown, 2000). Kramsch (1998) further states that language is an expression, an embodiment, and a symbol of cultural reality.

As any language is inseparable from its culture, English has also been introduced inseparably from its culture. Thus, Cortazzi and Jin (1999) asserted that teaching English will inevitably involve its culture, either source culture (cultures from origin countries the learners come from), target culture (cultures from origin countries where English is coming from, like US and UK), or international target culture (cultures from English speaking countries other than US and UK). These cultures are naturally embedded in learning English, either in the form of habits, food, norms, values, general beliefs, or lifestyles. It is often found when learners learn English through some media, such as television, newspaper, novels, books, or textbooks (Sadeghi & Sepahi, 2017). In relation to teaching English and culture, Adaskou et al. (1999) argue that almost everything in a language teaching and learning process is capable of carrying cultural information. The relative numbers of cultural information will depend on the selection of topics, conversational routines, characters, and places that are being used in language learning materials. In line with this, Yuen (2011) asserts that language learning materials often include culture as a theme. Cultural topics, such as customs and beliefs, occur widely in language learning materials. So, in learning a language, learners are also exposed to the cultures represented in these materials. Additionally, Sorongan et al. (2014) stated that textbooks are generally considered to be the major source of English teaching materials. They have an important role in integrating cultures or cultural elements in the teaching and learning process.

Nevertheless, the World Health Organization (WHO) declared Covid-19 as a global public health emergency as well as a pandemic on 11 March 2020 (Cucinotta & Vanelli, 2020). Certainly, this situation has seriously impacted every aspect of everyday life, including education. Thus, educational institutions across the globe need to follow social distancing measures by shutting down their schools and implementing online learning systems. So, they need to utilize the already available technical resources to create online learning material for students of all academic fields (Kaur, 2020). Regarding this situation, there must be an extensive need for online learning resources as materials for students, especially for Indonesian EFL learners.

Regarding the relationship between teaching English and culture, some researchers have emphasized this issue in their research (see Shin et al., 2011; Hilliard, 2014; Sadeghi & Sepahi, 2017). They revealed different portrayals of culture in all its dimensions and its relation to language learning. Moreover, in the Indonesian EFL context, numerous Indonesian scholars have widely debated the study of which culture is represented in the learning materials (see Erlina et al., 2018; Hermawan & Noerkhasanah, 2012; Munandar & Ulwiyah, 2012; Sorongan et al., 2014). Most of the studies mentioned above reported that cultural information is presented in EFL textbooks as the learning materials used for teaching English. However, these studies only focus on analyzing the classification of which and how the culture is portrayed in the textbooks, such as the so-called local culture, target culture, and international culture. There is very little attention to discuss the justification of how the cultural contents are also represented in online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners, more specifically in the reading materials. In this case, some scholars also have been trying to revisit the use of online resources in teaching English, specifically reading materials for students (see Gatsou et al., 2016; Hidayat, 2017; Asl et al., 2014). Most of them only

focus on how online resources can support English language learning processes by providing reading materials for students. In light of this, this study tries to extend the focus of discussion as well as enrich the literature by exploring different aspects of cultural representation in the reading materials from online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. In addition, given the large number of online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners available on the internet, studies are needed to shed light on the appropriateness of online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners in representing the cultural content as the learning materials used in the EFL context (Sadeghi & Sepahi, 2017). Hence, it becomes an excellent source to investigate which culture is represented in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. So, this study focuses on investigating the cultural content in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners and which elements of culture occur in each type of culture in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners.

Culture in EFL Materials

Cortazzi and Jin (1993) have classified cultural information in EFL materials. There are source cultures, target cultures, and international target cultures. These categorizations of culture indicate that EFL materials may contain cultural information from various cultures. EFL materials that load source culture mean that language learners 'own culture is displayed in the materials. This type of material is aimed at enabling learners to talk about their own culture to foreign visitors instead of preparing the students to encounter other cultures. Next, EFL materials that load target culture means that they display the culture of the United States or the United Kingdom, where English is used as the first language. Last, EFL materials that load international target culture means that they include the culture of English-speaking countries other than the UK and US, such as some Asian countries, some European countries, some African countries, etc.

Furthermore, apart from containing information about the source culture, target culture, and international target culture, Yuen (2011) categorizes the cultural information in EFL materials into four elements: products, persons, practices, and perspectives. In the EFL materials, elements of products are represented in the form of pictures, illustrations, or realia, which indicate tangible cultural objects, such as food, fashion, place, movie, song, news, etc. Next, the element of persons refers to famous and popular individuals or figures, actors, singers, and publicists, either real or fictional, from a particular culture. The element of practice refers to the real-life activities inherited by a particular community group and passed from generation to generation. It could be in the form of a celebration or a particular event. Lastly, the element of perspectives reflects the way certain groups of people see some aspects of life, like family relationships, friendships, concepts about money, time, et cetera. Both theories were used to analyze the cultural content i this study's online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learnersdy.

METHOD

This research was conducted qualitatively by using a content analysis method. As suggested by Ary et al. (2010), this kind of research design seeks to understand a phenomenon by focusing on the total picture of the quality of relationships, activities, situations, or materials. The goal is to get a holistic picture and in-depth understanding rather than a numeric analysis of data. Thus, this research is qualitative, considering several specific things thoroughly analyzed in this research. This research involved determining the example text of each unit to be analyzed and developing content categories and classifications. Furthermore, qualitative content analysis is one of the numerous research methods used to analyze text data. Research using qualitative content analysis focuses on the characteristics of the text with attention to the content or contextual meaning of the text. It also focuses on the frequency with which words or concepts occur in the texts or across the texts (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005; Carley, 1990). Thus, in order to see the presence of

cultural content in this study, the texts are investigated by employing the concept of Culture in EFL materials proposed by Cortazzi and Jin (1999). Reading materials were analyzed in terms of content. Content reading materials are classified into source culture, target culture, and international culture.

Culture in this context is perceived in terms of products, persons, practices, and perspectives (Yuen, 2011). The frequency of each category of culture is then converted to percentages for comparison purposes. These percentages are then analyzed to determine which culture is represented in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners and which category of culture occurs the most frequently. The findings are then discussed qualitatively to retort the research questions.

The data of this research were collected from the online learning materials published in the Online learning platform. The Online learning platform is an online learning application that was established in 2014. It provides various learning content such as tutorial videos, learning materials, exercises, private lessons, and tryouts for elementary to high school students that can be accessed online through a smartphone. According to the Online learning platform's official websites, in 2017, the Online learning platform became a government partner to provide a quality education through collaboration with 32 provincial governments and more than 326 city and district governments in Indonesia, so it became one of the most prominent online learning platforms in Indonesia.

The material being analyzed is English material for the tenth grade of Senior high school students. The materials of the resource are developed based on the content standards of the 2013 curriculum. The rationale for the material being chosen is mainly because of its possibility of containing cultural values and due to its suitability with the currently used curriculum for teaching English in Indonesia. The materials consist of four units, and each unit consists of various types of texts such as narrative, descriptive, recount, and announcement. The data of the research were mainly in the form of reading materials. The reading materials were chosen since they are highly likely to contain cultural values (Adaskou et al., 1990). The data were collected by selecting the reading materials available in English for the tenth-grade senior high school students published in the Online learning platform, which aligns with the content standards of the 2013 curriculum.

In analyzing the data, the researcher followed Ary et al. (2010) stages in analyzing qualitative research data. The stages included organizing and familiarizing, coding and reducing, and interpreting and representing. Initially, the researcher should be familiar with the data through reading and rereading, viewing, and reviewing the materials. Preferably, the researcher also wrote notes or memos to point out some key ideas. After being familiar with the data, the researcher organized the large body of the data by creating a complete list of the materials being analyzed. Next, the researcher began the coding and reducing process. It includes the identification of the categories and themes of the materials being analyzed. Then, the researcher interpreted and represented the data by making generalizations based on the connection and common aspects among the categories and patterns.

FINDINGS

The Representation of Culture in the Online Learning Materials for Indonesian EFL Learners

The investigation found some cultural content exists in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners analyzed. Forty-seven reading materials from four units in the Indonesian EFL online learning materials for the tenth grade of senior high school students were published in Online learning platform were analyzed in terms of cultural content.

By employing the content analysis method proposed by Ary et al. (2010) in analyzing the cultural content in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners, it can be concluded

that cultural content existed in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. Based on the analysis of reading materials in each unit, cultural contents were found in every unit. The investigation found that from 47 reading materials analyzed, there were 33 reading materials (70,21%) contained cultural content, while 14 reading materials (29,79%) did not contain any cultural content.

After finding that cultural content existed in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners, the cultural contents were then categorized based on Cortazzi and Jin (1999), who divided cultural contents in the learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners into the source culture (SC), the target culture (TC) and the international culture (ITC) to investigate which cultures are represented there. According to the data, the source culture contents were represented the most in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. The detailed results of the investigation of cultural contents investigation in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners are as follows:

Table 1
The Representation of Cultural Contents in the Reading Materials of the Online Learning Materials for Indonesian EFL Learners

Cultural Reference	Numbers of Reading Materials	%
Source Culture (SC)	15	31.25%
Target Culture (TC)	4	8.33%
International Culture (ITC)	8	16.67%
Both Source & Target Culture (SC&TC)	0	0.00%
Both Source & International Culture (SC&ITC)	5	10.42%
Both Target & International Culture (TC&ITC)	1	2.08%
Source, Target, & International Culture (SC, TC, & ITC)	0	0.00%
Culture Free	14	29.79%
Total	*47*	*100.00%*

According to the data, the source culture contents were represented the most in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. The reading materials focused only on the representation of the source culture (SC), were 15 reading materials or 31.25% of the total reading materials analyzed. Adding the reading materials representing both the source culture (SC) and the target culture (TC) and the reading materials representing both the source culture (SC) and the international culture (ITC), the number of reading materials representing the source culture (SC) was increased to 20 or 41.67% of the reading materials in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. The number of reading materials representing the target culture (TC) contents, including the reading materials representing both the target culture (TC) and the international culture (ITC), was five reading materials or 10.42% of the total reading materials. The reading materials representing the target culture (TC) alone were only four reading materials or only 8.33%. The reading materials focused only on the representation of the international culture (ITC) were 8 reading materials or 16.67% of the total reading materials analyzed. Adding the reading materials representing both the international culture (ITC) and the target culture (TC) and the reading materials representing both the International culture (ITC) and the source culture (SC), the number of reading materials representing the international culture (ITC) was increased to 14 or 29.17% of the reading materials in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. Meanwhile, there were 14 reading materials (29.79%) that did not refer to any culture.

Elements of Culture that Occur in the Online Learning Materials for Indonesian EFL Learners

Furthermore, since culture in this research is perceived in terms of products, persons, practices, and perspectives, as proposed by Yuen (2011), the frequency of each culture category was then

converted to percentages for comparison purposes. These percentages were then analyzed to determine which culture is represented in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners and which category of culture occurs the most frequently. Thus, the data are also presented in the following table.

Table 2
The Representation of Cultural Elements Occurences in the Reading Materials from each Unit of the Online Learning Materials for Indonesian EFL Learners

Category of Culture	Products (P1)	Persons (P2)	Practices (P3)	Perspectives (P4)	Total
SC	12	12	4	7	35
TC	1	4	0	0	5
ITC	8	7	4	3	22
Total	**21**	**23**	**7**	**10**	**61**
	(34.43%)	**(37.70%)**	**(11.48%)**	**(16.39%)**	**(100%)**

Table 2 shows the number of cultural content occurrences in each culture category. The target culture (TC) found in 5 reading materials was represented by 5 cultural contents. The source culture (SC) found in 20 reading materials was represented by 35 cultural contents, while the international culture (ITC) found in 14 reading materials was represented by 22 cultural contents. Regarding how cultures are represented in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners, culture was represented in all elements of culture. Among the four elements of culture, the element of persons (P2) with 23 contents (37.70%) and the element of products (P1) with 21 contents (34.43%) were predominant in representing cultures in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. The cultural contents were represented mostly through famous and popular places, food, individuals, or figures explained in the reading materials. Following the element of persons (P2) and the element of products (P1), the element of perspectives (P4) ranked third with 10 contents (16.39%). The cultural contents categorized as the element of perspectives (P4) explained how certain groups of people see some aspects of life, like beliefs, family relationships, friendships, concepts about money, time, et cetera. The element of practices falls third in representing cultures of the online learning material for Indonesian EFL learners, with 7 contents (11.48%) found. This element represented cultures in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners through real-life activities, which are inherited by a particular group of communities and passed from generation to generation.

DISCUSSIONS

The Representation of Culture in the Online Learning Materials for Indonesian EFL Learners

According to the data, the source culture (SC) contents were represented the most in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. This finding related to the frequency of cultural content in the English Materials is different from what Xiao (2011) found in the English textbook as the materials used for teaching English in China, Shin et al. (2011) found in the English textbook as the materials used for teaching English in several Asian countries, and Wahyuni et al. (2020) found in the English textbook as the materials used for teaching English in Indonesia. They found the target culture (TC) representations were predominant in the English materials they investigated. However, the finding is similar to what Rajabi and Ketabi (2012) found in the English textbooks as the materials used for teaching English in Iran. Hermawan and Noerkhasanah (2012) also found in the English textbook as the materials used for teaching English in Indonesia. They found more source culture (SC) representation in the English materials they investigated. In addition, it is observed that the cultural focus or content of these English materials for Indonesian

EFL learners is source culture (SC). In this respect, the EFL context in Indonesia is extended to the English as an international language (EIL) context as it is used to describe local culture and values to other global speakers of English. This is in line with McKay (2003), who asserted that one of the essences of a language to become an international language is that the language should accommodate speakers in describing their own culture as well as the concerns of other people from different cultures. It should also allow foreign speakers to describe their own norms and culture using this international language. Hence, English speakers nowadays do not only confront the culture of American or British people, but they also confront the culture of non-native speakers and introduce their own culture (Xiao, 2010; Kachru & Smith, 2008).

The finding that the source culture (SC) is predominant in the English materials produced locally is also in line with Dat (2008) and Cortazzi and Jin (1999), stating that the source culture (SC) usually is predominant in English materials produced locally. Dat (2008) stated that the representation of the source culture (SC) content in English materials is one of the strengths of English language learning due to the practicality and familiarity for the learners. Besides, the learners in the research site (Indonesian learners) need the ability to explain their own culture to other people. Foreign visitors and tourists might be visiting the research site and want to know about particular rituals or customs nearby. In this case, the learners need the ability to explain those things in English. Aside from the learners' needs, including more source culture (SC) content is also beneficial since it can make learners feel engaged as if the contents are part of their experience (Brown, 2000; Sahidudin, 2013).

Moreover, Boriboon (2004) in his study examined the disparity between students' daily lives and the discourse in the text materials they used. He compared examples about shopping and cuisine from a current popular English textbook, New Headway, with learners' lives in rural Thailand. The disparity between Thai culture and the scenarios presented in the textbook created reading comprehension difficulties for learners. As a solution, the author suggests that teachers encourage their students to modify or create dialogues based on their personal connections or experiences. In this case, the researcher believed that the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners investigated have been adjusted well toward the source culture representation. It is reflected in the way they present the reading materials and vocabulary. Some texts tell about Indonesian cultures, such as *Borobudur* and *Cendol,* and the vocabulary is also related to the topic and content. This indicates that the English learning focus in Indonesia has been set to encourage the students to share their ideas about local culture in English as the medium.

Regarding the representation of the international culture (ITC), the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners investigated were presented less frequently than the source culture (SC) representation. It may be insufficient to treat English as an international language. As English has become an international language, the possible cultural contexts encountered by English learners are not only the culture of The. Inner Circle countries, countries in which English is the first or the dominant language, but also the culture of The Outer Circle and Expanding Circle countries, countries where English is used as a second language in multilingual settings and where English is used as a foreign language for international communication (McKay, 2003; Jenkins, 2009; Kachru & Smith, 2008). Thus, the term intercultural understanding refers to not only the understanding of the culture of The Inner Circle countries' people but also the understanding of people's culture worldwide. Gunantar (2017), who found similar findings in his investigation about teaching English and culture, suggested that there are tangible advantages gained by including International culture in the English materials in order to promote English as an international language. Cortazzi and Jin (1999), who seem to support more inclusion of the target culture in English materials, also agree that inter- and intra-cultural variations need to be represented in the English materials to show that the English world does not belong to a unified, monolithic culture. Thus, it is wise to include various cultural situations in the English materials. They also stated that International culture (ITC) elements in English materials could increase the understanding of

English as an international language, appreciation of the local culture, accommodate the learners to travel internationally and contact others, and motivate the learners.

Meanwhile, in terms of frequency, the target culture (TC) representation significantly falls behind the source culture (SC) and the international culture (ITC). The number of reading materials containing the target culture (TC) contents is only a few of the total reading materials. Considering the fact that Indonesia belongs to the English as a foreign language context, exposure to the target language cultural contexts is considered important due to the very limited English environment nearby (Byram, 1989). However, the finding of the investigation shows that the target culture (TC) representation is less than the source (SC), and the international culture (ITC) is also considered reasonable. Including more target culture (TC) content in English materials can expose learners to 'new' experiences (Dat, 2008) and show how other groups of society with different cultural backgrounds live (Byram, 1989). Thus, the target culture contents in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners may not be practical for the learners. Some of them may even be contradictory to learners' local values. Since the content is not practical for the learners, the possibility of negative psychological distance to occur is high (Gass & Selinker, 2008). The learners may feel less motivated to learn the target language since the contents are considered unnecessary. In the same vein, Adaskou et al. (1990), in their study of teaching materials in Moroccan secondary schools, found that nothing beneficial or motivating in including Western culture. By introducing Western culture, there's a tendency for cultural comparison, which in turn will breed discontent among learners with their own culture. Besides, certain patterns of behavior in English-speaking social contexts are not desirable, being incompatible with local values. Finally, the teachers in the study believe that motivation in learning English will improve if the language is presented in contexts relevant to learners' lives as young adults rather than in the context of an English-speaking country. On the other hand, Kirkgoz and Ağçam (2011) asserted in their study that the learners' perception of their own culture, in addition to the target culture, is an important factor in the development of their cultural awareness. Although the inclusion of the local culture is important in nationally produced materials, it may be argued that EFL/ESL students should also be exposed to materials that focus on the target language cultures. This allows students to compare and contrast their culture with other global cultures, increasing their awareness of the social conventions of other cultures and thereby expanding their cultural knowledge. Similarly, Shin (2011) stated in his study that the lack of target cultural perspectives could create a barrier for students who are seeking to improve their intercultural competence and target language skills. He further suggested that English materials need to be localized but should also include target and global culture to facilitate learners' intercultural competence. Thus, it follows from the above discussion that in the process of teaching and learning English, a good balance between source and target cultural elements in English materials is needed. Although the findings can be very subjective and further research needs to be conducted to prove the claim, the possibility that the target culture (TC) contents represented in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners are considered insufficient may also happen, as what has been found in this study.

Elements of Culture that Occur in the Online Learning Materials for Indonesian EFL Learners

According to the data analysis, cultural contents in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners generally are represented by all elements of culture. The element of products (P1) and the elements of persons (P2) were found to be predominant in representing culture in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners, followed by the element of perspective (P4), and the last was the element of practices (P3). The finding that cultures are mostly represented by the element of products (P1) and the element of persons (P2) is in line with Kramsch (1991) and Xiao (2010), who stated that many English classrooms regard cultures merely as the big "C" of cultures or the product of cultures which can be discerned. Kramsch (1991) suggested that

cultural contents in the element of products should be explained to the extent why the cultures are formed and what values behind the cultures are. In the case of the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners investigated, the cultural contents in the element of products were explained enough to the extent that it is related to culture as the way of life. For instance, the element of products (P1) in the form of Borobudur Temple in Unit 1, Lake Toba in unit 4, Soekarno in unit 3, and Benjamin Franklin in unit 3. Those elements of products (P1) and persons (P2)contents can be used to explain the way of life of a particular culture, such as explaining why a character in the story wants to choose his/her own way of life or why particular characters are represented in certain ways. Culture as a way of life needs to be included because it is related to the usage of the target language in the real social context. This is in line with Byram (1991), who asserted that introducing the cultural aspects of language and the social context where it is used can enhance learners' language awareness component of learning and improve language proficiency of learners.

Furthermore, based on the findings, the source culture (SC) was represented mostly by the elements of products (P1) and persons (P2). The source culture contents in the element of persons (P2) mostly were in the forms of recount texts and narrative texts. The source culture (SC) contents in the element of persons (P2) represented can be considered from learners' culture since they clearly portrayed the people with their traditional culture of Indonesia and the source culture's folktales which employed some fictional characters from Indonesia, which are regarded as familiar cultural contents in most English classes (Kramsch, 1991). This way, the source culture (SC) contents helping learners to learn the target language due to its familiarity are optimized (Cunningsworth, 1995; Munandar and Ulwiyah, 2012).

Meanwhile, the cultural contents in the element of products (P1) mostly were in the form of famous and popular places and food of the source culture (SC) people, such as Borobudur Temple, Cendol, Pura Luhur Uluwatu Bali, Lake Toba, etc. Most of the source culture contents in this element are represented in the form of descriptive text. Since the information in descriptive texts is potentially rich in presenting cultural information, in this case, there are a large number of occurrences of descriptive texts depicting cultural contents. For describing places, for instance, a descriptive text about Borobudur Temple, Pura Luhur Uluwatu, Bali Ulun Danu Beratan Temple, and Bogor Botanical Garden are good resources for intercultural information. Additionally, for describing things, descriptive texts about Cendol, a traditional food from Java, are also culturally rich in facilitating intercultural information in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners being investigated. It might be aimed at triggering learners to be able to explain or compare their own culture with other cultures and then come to an intercultural understanding (Adaskou, Britten & Fahsi, 1990).

Moreover, in terms of the frequency of the international culture (ITC) found in each element of culture, the finding shows that the international culture (ITC) was represented by all of the four elements of culture. Most of the cultural contents were described explicitly, along with the settings and characters from a particular culture. This is in line with Cortazzi & Jin (1999) and Matsuda (2003), who implied that in order to promote international culture (ITC) contents, the settings and characters from the culture should be explicitly described. Otherwise, it is going to be difficult to identify that particular cultural content belongs to the international culture (ITC). Thus, further investigations were employed to determine in order to find which elements of culture that cultural contents belong.

The investigation also found that the element of products (P1) was found to be significantly predominant in representing the international culture in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. Meanwhile, the element of products (P1) and persons (P2) was also found in the target culture content. In comparison, the occurrence of the element of practices (P3) and perspectives (P4) was neglected to zero. This dominant presence of product elements (P1) found in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners is also in line with Yuen

(2011), who found in his study about cultural content in English materials, that cultural content regarding products appears most frequently in the samples with places, entertainment, and food being the major types. Similarly, Kramsch (1993) also asserted that in many language classes, culture was frequently reduced to "the four Fs," which means "food, fairs, folklores, and statistical facts," which, in this case, can also be included in the element of products. The finding that the element of products (P1) is predominant in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners is also in line with Yuen (2011), who further asserted that the potential interest of the students towards the material is an important criterion. Students' interest may be more easily aroused by popular products such as famous places, entertainment, travel, and food than by more abstract elements such as perspectives (P4) or practice (P3).

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

This research is aimed at investigating cultural content represented in online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. In particular, this research investigates which cultures are represented in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners. The investigation has revealed two major points; the source culture is predominantly represented compared to the target culture and the international culture, and the culture is mostly represented through the element of products and the element of persons.

This research has confirmed the findings from previous research on the representation of culture in English materials conducted by Rajabi and Ketabi (2012), Munandar and Ulwiyah (2012), and Hermawan and Noerkhasanah (2012). Despite the limitations of the findings covered, this study has revealed that cultural values exist in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners, the source culture was predominant, and the cultural contents mostly were represented in the element of products.

The number of reading materials containing source culture is more than half of the total reading materials that contain cultural information. The fact that the source culture is predominant in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners leads to some possible implications. The strength of the source culture, which is a familiarity to learners, is prioritized in the materials investigated since the source culture is predominantly represented. Thus, as elaborated earlier, another consequence of English as an international language is that English should accommodate learners to describe their own culture to other people from different cultural backgrounds. Thus, the essence of English as an international language which allows learners to describe their own culture in this language, is optimized. Aside from the learners' needs, including more source culture content is also beneficial since it can make learners feel engaged, as if the contents are part of their experience.

In terms of the frequency of each culture category found in the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners, the element of persons and products ranks the top in representing the cultural content, followed by the element of perspectives and the element of practices. It is in line with some investigations, revealing that many English classrooms regard cultures merely as the big "C" of cultures or the product of cultures that can be discerned. Cultural contents in the element of products should be explained to the extent why the cultures are formed and what values behind the cultures are. In the case of the online learning materials for Indonesian EFL learners investigated, the cultural contents in the element of products were explained enough to the extent that it is related to culture as the way of life.

Relevant to the findings, discussion, and conclusion of this study, there are several points of suggestion. First, it is suggested that English materials developers should include more target culture and international culture content. The use of English should also be related to The Inner Circle countries. The particular ways of life of people from the target culture should be represented more. By so doing, it allows students to compare and contrast their culture with other global

cultures, increasing their awareness of the social conventions of other cultures and thereby expanding their cultural knowledge. English materials need to be localized but should also include target and global culture to facilitate learners' intercultural competence. Thus, it follows from the above discussion that in the process of teaching and learning English, a good balance between source and target cultural elements in English materials is needed.

Second, the element of culture should be added, not only focused on product and person. Practice and perspective should also be added. Thus the learners will gain a better understanding beyond the surface of the culture.

Lastly, the result of the investigation is expected to provide more insights for similar research to be conducted. Due to some limitations, the research has, it is possible to conduct similar research involving more English materials from different levels and publishers. The same research with different tools of analysis might be conducted as well in the future. Lastly, by conducting this kind of research, it is expected that educational practitioners give more concern to cultural content analysis in English materials development processes.

REFERENCES

Adaskou, K., Britten, D., & Fahsi, B. (1990). Design decisions on the cultural content of a secondary English course for Morocco. *ELT Journal*, *44*(1), 3-10.

Ary, D., Jacobs, L. C., & Sorensen, C. (2010). *Introduction to Research in.* Education. USA: Wadsworth

Asl, H., D., Ghassemi, M., & Madadi, A. (2014). The impact of cooperative reading E-Materials adaptation on reading comprehension performance of Iranian EFL learners. *Journal of Education and Human Development*, 3(2), 573-587.

Brown, H. D. (2000). *Principles of Language Learning and Teaching.* USA: San Francisco State University.

Byram, M. (1989). *Cultural Studies in Foreign Language Education.* Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

Carley K. (1990). Content analysis. In Asher RE (Ed.), *The Encyclopedia of Language and Linguistics,* 2, (725–730). Pergamon: Edinburgh.

Cortazzi, M., & Jin, L. (1999). Cultural mirrors: Materials and methods in the EFL Classroom. In E. Hinkel (Ed.), *Culture in second language teaching and learning,* (pp. 196-219). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Cucinotta, D., & Vanelli, M. (2020). WHO declares COVID-19 a pandemic. *Acta Bio-Medica: Atenei Parmensis, 91*(1), 157-160. https://doi.org/10.23750/abm.v91i1.9397

Damar, E. (2013). Culture: Is it an avoidable or adorable concept in EFL settings?. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences. 93*. 752-755. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.09.275

Erlina, D., Marzulina, L., Pitaloka, N. L., Astrid, A., Yansyah, F., & Mukminin, A. (2018). Research on educational media: Balancing between local and target language cultures in English electronic textbooks. *TOJET: The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology, 17*(2), 111-119.

Gatsou, C., Politis, A., & Dimitrios, Z. (2016). E-reading in different media: An exploration to user experience. *International Journal of Computer Science and Applications*, 13(2), 122-137.

Hermawan, B., & Noerkhasanah, L. (2012). Traces of cultures in English textbooks for primary education. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics, 1*(2), 49-61. https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v1i2.84

Hidayat, N. (2017). Developing E-Reading Materials for Students at Grade Seven. *Journal of English Educators Society. 2*(1), 33-44. https://doi.org/10.21070/jees.v2i1.676

Hilliard, A. D. (2014). A critical examination of representation and culture in four English language textbooks. *Language Education in Asia, 5*(2), 238-252. https://doi.org/10.5746/LEiA/14/V5/I2/A06/Hilliard

Hinkel, E. (1999). Introduction: Culture in research and second language pedagogy. In E. Hinkel (Ed.), *Culture in Second Language Teaching and Learning.* New York: Cambridge University Press.

Holmes, J. (2001). *An introduction to sociolinguistics (2nd ed.).* London: Longman

Hsieh, H.-F., & Shannon, S. E. (2005). Three Approaches to Qualitative Content Analysis. *Qualitative Health Research, 15*(9), 1277–1288. Doi: https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732305276687

Jiang, W. (2000). The relationship between culture and language. *ELT Journal, 54*(4), 328-333. https://doi.org/10.1093/ELT/54.4.328

Kachru, Y. & Smith, L. E. (2008). *Cultures, Contexts, and World Englishes.* New York: Routledge.

Kaur, G. (2020). Digital Life: Boon or bane in teaching sector on COVID-19. *CLIO an Annual Interdisciplinary Journal of History, 6*(6), 416-427.

Kramsch, C. J. (1998). *Language and culture.* Oxford, OX: Oxford University Press.

McKay, S. L. (2003). EIL Curriculum Development. *RELC Journal, 34*(1), 31-47. [online: http://rel.sagepub.com/content/34/1/31 accessed 17 December 2020].

Munandar, M. I., & Ulwiyah, I. (2012). Intercultural approaches to the cultural content of Indonesia's high school EFL textbooks. *CS Canada: Cross-Cultural Communication*, 8(5), 67-73.

Nguyen, H., Warren, W., & Fehring, H. (2014). Factors affecting English language teaching and learning in higher education. *English Language Teaching*, *7*(8), 94-105. https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v7n8p94

Richards, J. C. (2001). *The Role of Textbooks in a Language Program.* Cambridge University Press.

Rogers, E.M., & Steinfatt, T.M. (1999). *Intercultural Communication. Illinois*. Waveland Press.

Sadeghi, K., & Sepahi, Z. (2017). Cultural content of three EFL textbooks: teachers' and learners' cultural preferences and cultural themes of textbooks. *Pedagogies: An International Journal, 13*, 1-24. https://doi.org/10.1080/1554480X.2017.1417128

Shin, J., Eslami, Z., & Chen, W. (2011). Presentation of local and international culture in current international English-language teaching textbooks*. Language, Culture and Curriculum, 24*(3), 253-268. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/07908318.2011.614694

Sorongan, D. A., Susanti, R., & Syahri, I. (2014). An analysis of local and target culture integration in English textbooks. *LINGUA, Jurnal Bahasa & Sastra,* 15(1).

Xiao, J. (2010). *Cultural Contents of an in-use EFL Textbooks and English Major Students' Attitude and Perceptions towards Culture Learning at Jiangxi University of Science and Technology, China.* Thesis Unpublished Material Submitted to The Graduate School Prince of Songkla University.

Yuen, K. M., (2011). The representation of foreign cultures in English textbooks. *ELT Journal. 65*(4). 458-466. https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/ccq089

Zaid, M. A. (1999). Cultural confrontation and cultural acquisition in the EFL classroom. *IRAL, 37*(2), 111-127. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.09.275